

**Minutes
Housing Trust Fund Advisory Board
April 12, 2010**

Minutes for Housing Trust Fund (HTF) Advisory Board held on Monday, April 12, 2010, 6:00p.m., in Hatton Hall, 34 East 7th Street Building B, Tempe, Arizona.

HTF Advisory Board Members Present:

Kolby Granville
Shane Graser
Todd Marshall
Kevin Kaesberg
Myra Jefferson
Neil Calfee
Stanley Nicpon

HTF Advisory Board Members Absent:

None

Council Members Present:

Vice Mayor, Shana Ellis

City Staff Present:

Craig Hittie, Community Development/Housing Services
Liz Chavez, Community Development/Housing Services

Members of the Public Present:

Jayson Matthews, Tempe Community Council

The meeting was called to order at 6:02 PM by Board Chair, Todd Marshall

Agenda Item 1- Public Comment

No public comments

Agenda Item 2- Acceptance of March 8, 2010 Meeting Minutes (Todd Marshall, Chair)

- March minutes were approved, as amended, unanimously.

Agenda Item 3- Reminder of City of Tempe Board and Commission guidelines relating to attendance (Craig Hittie, City of Tempe)

- Craig Hittie referred the Board Members to Article V. Boards, Commissions, ETC., Division 1, Sec 2-181 which states: “All boards and commissions established by the city shall have the following powers and duties unless otherwise specified...(4) To require attendance of the members at regular meetings and provide that absence from three (3) consecutive regular meetings or six (6) meetings within any twelve (12) month time period without consent from the chairman or vice-chairman if the chairman is unavailable, shall be deemed to constitute a resignation and such position shall thereupon be deemed vacant.”

Agenda Item 4-Discussion of Additional HTFAB Goals (Group Discussion)

- Todd Marshall opened the discussion by clarifying the content of a previous email (content of the email is incorporated into these minutes as Attachment A). Specifically, Todd clarified that the additional Board goals mentioned in the email were not to be considered all-inclusive. Todd explained that other goals could also be discussed by the Board at this time.
- In addition, Todd discussed with the Board that it was his intent and/or hope to iron out these goals, as well as any other goals offered by the other Board members, during the current meeting and perhaps May’s meeting.
- Todd also proposed the possibility of postponing the regularly scheduled June and/or July meetings while the City’s budget, reorganization and sales tax referendum issues are concluded.
- Kolby Granville moved to adopt the goals discussed in the email and listed below as items 2-4. In addition, Kolby requested approval of a goal not addressed in the email. The additional goal is listed below as item 5.

Goals for the Tempe HTFAB (adopted): (Extracted from Attachment A)

1. To serve households with incomes between 80% and 120% of the area median income (AMI) published annually by HUD for the Phoenix-Mesa-Scottsdale MSA.

Goals for the Tempe HTFAB (proposed):

2. To educate the community on the long term benefits of affordable housing and the HTF.
3. To recommend a target funding goal for the HTF.
4. To recommend policies for HTF fund distribution based on the funding goal.

5. To recommend a **dedicated** funding source for the HTF (*emphasis added*)

- Motion to adopt Goals 2-5 seconded by Neil Calfee.
- Discussion on the Goals followed.
- Kevin Kaesberg asked for clarification from Kolby as to Kolby’s understanding of the meaning of the word “dedicated”.
- Different interpretations of the word were offered by Kolby, Neil and Stanley Nicpon.
- Discussion as to the possible contribution to the HTF by an individual benefactor occurred as well.

- Craig Hittie explained to the Board that after discussions with the City Attorney's office, he concluded that private donations to the HTF would not be permitted pursuant Arizona state law that forbids gifts to municipal governments.
- Several Board members expressed concerns about this possible limitation on funding sources for the HTF and requested clarification on the legal question.
- Todd stated that he would discuss the issue with the City Attorney's office and request the presence of the City Attorney at the next Committee meeting to answer the myriad of questions the Board members had related to this issue.
- Discussion concluded and the Board Chair requested a vote on the outstanding motion by Kolby Granville.
- The motion failed 4-3. Voting Aye: Kolby Granville, Neil Calfee and Myra Jefferson. Voting Nay: Todd Marshall, Kevin Kaesberg, Stanley Nicpon and Shane Graser.
- Shane moved for the adoption of Board Goals 2-4 (above).
- Motion seconded by Neil Calfee.
- Motion passed 7-0.
- Kevin Kaesberg moved for the adoption of Board Goal #5 (above) with word "dedicated" removed.
- Motion seconded by Neil Calfee
- Discussion of the meaning of the word "dedicated" followed.
- Goal #5 to read: "To recommend a funding source for the HTF"
- Motion to approve Goal#5, as amended, passed 6-1. Voting Aye: Kolby Granville, Neil Calfee, Myra Jefferson, Kevin Kaesberg, Stanley Nicpon and Shane Graser. Voting Nay: Todd Marshall.
- Further discussion of possible additional Board Goals followed, however, the Board agreed to table additional goals until the Board receives clarification from the City Attorney regarding the legal structure of the HTF and any possible restrictions on funding streams.

Agenda Item 5-Calendar of Events Related to Housing on Local and State Levels (Craig Hittie, City of Tempe)

- Craig Hittie reviewed the handout (Attachment B) with the Board

Agenda Item 6- Future Agenda Items (Group Discussion)

- Legal Structure of the HTF and related funding limitations, specifically the acceptance of gifts to the HTF by private benefactors. (City Attorney or Assistant City Attorney)
- Potential Uses of the HTF. (Group Discussion)

Agenda Item 7- Future Meeting Date and Time

- Date for the next HTFAB meeting scheduled for May 10, 2010 at 6:00 PM.

Agenda Item 8 Adjournment

- Board Chair adjourned the meeting at 7:15 PM.

Prepared by: Craig Hittie

Reviewed by Todd Marshall

Attachment A

Fellow board members, please confirm your attendance to the April 12th HTFAB meeting. As always, the agenda and past minutes can be found at:

<https://tempe.gov/housing/PublicBodies/HousingTrustFundBoard/>

The agenda will have an item that continues to discuss the goals of the HTFAB. As you recall, we adopted a Mission Statement in November along with 1 of the 4 proposed goals. The adopted and proposed goals are as follows:

Housing Trust Fund Advisory Board

mission statement - adopted 11.09.09

The Housing Trust Fund Advisory Board (HTFAB) seeks to provide resources to promote, create and preserve Affordable Housing throughout the City of Tempe. The HTFAB serves the Tempe City Council (Council) and as such, will work with the Community Development Manager to make recommendations to the Council on matters relating to the sourcing and distribution of funds and related policy. The HTF seeks to secure funds for the purpose of creating diverse housing opportunities including the creation and preservation of rental, home ownership and mixed-use opportunities. HTF funds will be used primarily to support private housing opportunities which provide for the acquisition, rehabilitation or construction of Workforce Housing and shall only be applied to the affordable units within a development.

Goals for the Tempe HTFAB (adopted):

1. To serve households with incomes between 80% and 120% of the area median income (AMI) published annually by HUD for the Phoenix-Mesa-Scottsdale MSA.

Goals for the Tempe HTFAB (proposed):

2. To educate the community on the long term benefits of affordable housing and the HTF.
3. To recommend a target funding goal for the HTF.
4. To recommend policies for HTF fund distribution based on the funding goal.

The proposed goals are intended to solidify the broader discussions that have taken place over the past several months and should serve to guide the Board in staying on course. The expectation is to discuss and vote on these proposed goals (or variation of). If you have additional goals to be discussed and considered, please prepare and bring to the meeting. The next steps would be to develop action items to support the goals so pending the time, we may get a chance to discuss or at least set future agenda items.

At the March meeting there was a request to discuss a Redevelopment Department study related to the concept of a density bonus. Because that that effort is indefinitely stalled, combined with the HTFAB's specific purview and my desire to focus this board's efforts on the significant work in front of us, I have requested that we not agendize this item at this time.

I look forward to seeing all of you at Hatton Hall **6:00** (that's PM - Craig) on May 12th.

Todd Marshall

Attachment B

Affordable Housing Upcoming Events and Available Resources

ON THE CALENDAR:

- April 1-30; Public Comment Period for the FY 2010-2011 Annual Action Plan and FY2010-2014 Consolidated Plan
- April 7th; ADOH Public Hearing for “Arizona Foreclosure Prevention Innovative Fund” <http://www.azhousing.gov/ShowPage.aspx?ID=397>
- April 15th @1PM ; Sustainable Affordable Housing & Transportation for Sustainable Livable Communities event at the Tempe Transit Center http://www.azhousing.gov/calendar_details.aspx?ID=163
 - SESSION 1 ::
Sustainable Transportation and Housing for Sustainable Communities
 - SESSION 2 ::
Using the Housing + Transportation Affordability Index for your Community

HELPFUL LINKS:

To Join Tempe’s Affordable Housing Listserv: www.tempe.gov/lists
Tempe’s Housing Services Main Page: www.tempe.gov/housing
Arizona Housing Alliance: www.azhousingalliance.org
Arizona Foreclosure Prevention Taskforce: www.azforeclosureprevention.org
Urban Land Institute: www.uli.org
Arizona Department of Housing: www.housingaz.com