



TEMPE
PRESERVATION

TEMPE HISTORIC
PRESERVATION
COMMISSION

Ira Bennett, Alternate
Anne Bilsbarrow, Chair
April Bojorquez
Brad Graham
Andrea Gregory, Vice Chair
Charlie Lee
Korri Turner
Vacant, Alternate
Vacant, Alternate

TEMPE HISTORIC
PRESERVATION
OFFICE

Amy Douglass
Nathan Hallam
Wm. "Billy" Kiser
Alyssa Matter
Joe Nucci
Mark Vinson

The City of Tempe is a
Certified Local Government,
in association with the United
States Department of the
Interior / National Park Service

Tempe Historic
Preservation Office
Community Development
Department
31 East 5th Street
P.O. Box 5002
Tempe, AZ 85280

480.350.8028
8579 FAX; 8913TDD
tempe.gov/historicpres

Borden Homes Historic District Design Guidelines Work Group MEETING MINUTES

Date: WEDNESDAY, November 9, 2011

Location: Fire Station 1, 1400 E Apache Blvd

6:43 PM Call to Order, sign in, introductions, (please mute cell phones)

Tempe Preservation Present: Andrea Gregory, Joe Nucci

Stakeholders Present: Diana Buehler, Chuck Buss, Joe Emery, Will Heasley (ASU), Gary Martelli, Chris McKee, Amye Snyder, George Wittenberg

1. **Call to Audience** – no response

2. **First Borden Homes Historic District Design Guidelines Meeting** – Tempe Preservation will work with historic district stakeholders to prepare design guidelines that reflect the neighborhood vision for the future of the historic district.

2.1 Introductions and neighborhood vision statements

2.1.1 Joe Nucci – statistics comparing Borden Homes Historic District to similar neighborhoods city-wide reflect favorably on increasing owner-occupancy in the Borden Homes Historic District.

2.1.2 Gary Martelli – would like to develop community among neighborhoods, maintain pocket, owner occupancy, not concerned with original landscape style.

2.1.3 Amye Snyder – concerned about restrictions, likes unique houses with similar designs, know neighbors based on homes, (also concerned about parking).

2.1.4 Diana Buehler – concerned about restrictions, likes variety and different paint schemes, interested in improving energy efficiency, owner occupancy, concerned with landscape maintenance.

2.1.5 Chuck Buss – would like to see less insensitive modernization, understands the value of the historic district as a selling point based on tax benefits and marketing, likes flood irrigation.

2.1.6 George Wittenberg – likes flood irrigation, masonry homes, location near the University, hopes to see better landscape maintenance, hopes Borden Homes Historic District will remain integral to the future of Tempe and continue to be recognizable as a unique part of the community.

2.1.7 Chris McKee – likes the uniformity of the homes, lush landscaping, hopes to see teeth in the guidelines to enable sensitive restoration, likes the historic version of the neighborhood.

2.1.8 Joe Emery – would like to see the character and uniqueness maintained, likes the variety of the homes and the historic integrity of the neighborhood overall.



2.2) Design Guidelines Work Group process overview – Tempe Preservation intends to meet with stakeholders every 30 days or so until Design Guidelines are completed.

2.2.1 Work Group will continue to discuss and consider a vision for neighborhood change until a general consensus for the effect of guidelines can be determined. The Group will work through the technical sections of the guidelines and revisit the changing future vision as we go. This iterative process will continue to deepen the understanding of how guidelines can direct specific changes in neighborhood character and may result in a document that represents the majority view for the future of the Borden Homes Historic District.

2.2.2 Work Group will review the National Register Nomination materials in preparation for the next Group meeting and to identify character-defining features of the individual houses and of the neighborhood overall.

2.2.3 Work Group will review examples of Design Guidelines to determine desired format. The [Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation](#) represent a broad philosophical basis for the rehabilitation of historic properties. When used as design guidelines, the Standards allow for a great range of workable solutions due, in part, on their lack of specificity. More tightly structured guidance would result in a more predictable outcome from project to project and over time even as city staff and commission volunteers may come and go. Staff distributed the [Roosevelt Addition Historic District Design Guidelines](#) which are considered to represent a point of departure from which the Borden Homes Historic District Design Guidelines can be developed. Although the Roosevelt Addition Historic District Design Guidelines are Tempe's first and so far only guidelines, they represent the vision of the district stakeholders for the future of their neighborhood and provide a very workable example. Staff speculated that the Borden Homes process may well result in a document somewhere between these two examples.

3. What Design Guidelines Can and Can Not Do – Staff explained that design guidelines do not replace [Tempe Zoning & Development Code Standards](#). Guidelines seek to inform property owners about what distinguishes their property and makes it worthy of preservation. Guidelines also attempt to encourage discovery of solutions that balance the demands of a modern lifestyle with the uniqueness of owning a home in an historic district.

4. How the National Register Nomination Informs Design Guidelines – Both processes seek to identify the character-defining feature of the neighborhood and of the individual properties therein. Both processes also survey and inventory neighborhood integrity. The [Borden Homes Historic District National Register Nomination](#) prepared by Scott Solliday provides an evaluation of the contributing or non-contributing status of each individual property and of general neighborhood features. The Design Guidelines will seek to conserve and enhance these features as the neighborhood continues to change.

5. Roosevelt Addition Historic District Design Guidelines – Staff distributed copies of the [Roosevelt Addition Historic District Design Guidelines](#) as a point of departure from which we may begin to develop unique guidelines for the Borden Homes Historic District. Stakeholders were encouraged to explore other design guidelines and to bring examples that may be of interest to the group in terms of format, accessibility, or which may be relevant to the pursuit of the neighborhood vision.

6. Next Meeting Objectives

6.1) Work Group will identify a vision for neighborhood change – although articulation of a vision for the future of the Borden Homes Historic District may continue to evolve and change over the course of Design Guidelines development and beyond, a consensus on how guidelines should inform and effect change must be established to begin the iterative process.

6.2) Work Group will discuss & consider neighborhood historic character – sensitivity to and awareness of the character-defining features that make the neighborhood and the individual properties unique, will no doubt expand as we work through the design guidelines process. Synthesis of the information in the National Register Nomination into declarations of what guidelines should help to preserve is one of the first steps in preparing the guidelines document.

7. Next Meeting Date: Wednesday December 14, 2011 (second Wednesday) 6:30 pm at Fire Station 1, 1400 E Apache Blvd

Adjourn: 8:30 PM